



**THE STATES assembled on Thursday
10th December 2020, at 9.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Bailiff,
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,
Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S.,
C.C.M.I. was present.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Sarah Craig Ferguson – excused attendance (joined at 5.12 p.m.)
Senator John Alexander Nicholas Le Fondré – excused attendance (joined at 9.37 a.m.)
Senator Tracey Anne Vallois – ill
Deputy Gregory Charles Umberto Guida of St. Lawrence – excused attendance (joined at 9.43 a.m.)

Prayers

Standing Order 55A – meeting held remotely

THE STATES assembled remotely, in accordance with Standing Order 55A, as the Bailiff considered that it was not possible to convene or maintain a quorate meeting in view of a substantial risk to the health of both States Members and the public.

Notification of lodged propositions

| | |
|--|-------------------------|
| School Closures. Lodged: 8th December 2020. <i>Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier.</i> | P.163/2020. |
| School Closures (P.163/2020): amendment. Lodged: 10th December 2020. <i>Deputy K.G. Pamplin of St. Saviour.</i> | P.163/2020. Amd. |
| School Closures (P.163/2020): second amendment. Lodged: 10th December 2020. <i>Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour.</i> | P.163/2020. Amd.(2). |

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES, adopting the request of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier, agreed in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of his proposition entitled ‘School Closures’ (P.163/2020) in order that it might be debated at the present meeting.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 29

CONTRE: 12

ABSTAIN: 1

Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy of St. Peter

Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré

THE STATES, adopting the request of Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour, agreed in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of his amendment (P.163/2020 Amd.) to the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier entitled ‘School Closures’ (P.163/2020) in order that it might be debated at the present meeting.

THE STATES, adopting the request of Deputy Louise Mary Catherine of St. Saviour, agreed in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), to reduce the minimum lodging period in respect of his amendment (P.163/2020 Amd.(2)) to the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier entitled ‘School Closures’ (P.163/2020) in order that it might be debated at the present meeting.

Oral Questions without notice

(see Official Report/Hansard)

A period of questions without notice was held, during which questions were permitted to any Minister on Covid-related matters.

Arrangement of public business for the present meeting

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy Judith Ann Martin of St. Helier, agreed that it would complete consideration of the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier entitled ‘School Closures’ (P.163/2020) that day.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 39

CONTRE: 0

ABSTAIN: 0

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

School Closures P.163/2020

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier entitled ‘School Closures’ (P.163/2020) and rejected the first part of an amendment of Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour (P.163/2020 Amd.) that after the words “state-run schools”, the words “from Monday 14th December” should be deleted and that after the words “state-run schools”, there should be inserted the following words –

“to all pupils in years 8 and above, with all Colleges to close on 11th December at the end of the school day and all secondary schools from year 8 upwards to close from 14th December at the end of the school day”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 12

CONTRE: 32

ABSTAIN: 0

Senator K.L. Moore
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier, rejected the second part of the amendment of Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour that, after the words “key-workers,” there should be inserted the words “and those children whose parents have no access to alternative childcare.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 22

Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy of St. John

CONTRE: 22

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

| | |
|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H) | Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H) |
| Deputy J.H. Perchard (S) | Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C) |
| Deputy R.J. Ward (H) | Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L) |
| Deputy C.S. Alves (H) | Deputy of St. Peter |
| Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S) | Deputy of Trinity |
| Deputy I. Gardiner (H) | Deputy S.M. Ahier (H) |

THE STATES noted that, as there was an equality of votes, the matter had been determined in the negative in accordance with Article 16(2) of the States of Jersey Law 2005.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier and, adopting the third part of the amendment of Deputy Kevin Glyn Pamplin of St. Saviour, agreed that the existing paragraph should be designated as paragraph (a) and that the following additional paragraphs should be inserted –

- “(b) that any such provision under paragraph (a) takes into account the enhanced monitoring systems that are in place for vulnerable children;
- (c) to request the Minister for Education to ensure that all schools allow parents to keep their children at home based on their concerns for the risk of virus transmission and not classify such children as being absent without authorisation (as long as the child has access and support provided to continue their studies); and
- (d) to request the Minister for Education and the Minister for Children and Housing to ensure that the necessary resources are made available to children and young people to ensure their access to mental health assistance is not reduced.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 24

Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

CONTRE: 21

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier entitled 'School Closures' (P.163/2020) and rejected part 1 of an amendment of Deputy Louise Mary Catherine Doublet of St. Saviour (P.163/2020 Amd.(2)) that, after the words "appropriate and practical", there should be inserted the words " , and Early Years pupils, as the Minister considers appropriate and practical".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 16

Senator K.L. Moore
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

CONTRE: 29

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier, as amended, rejected the second part of the amendment of Deputy Louise Mary Catherine of St. Saviour that, after the words "appropriate and practical" there should be inserted the words " , and students in exam years, as the Minister considers appropriate and practical".

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 18

Senator K.L. Moore
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Ouen

CONTRE: 27

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Mary

ABSTAIN: 0

| | |
|----------------------------|---------------------------|
| Connétable of St. Martin | Deputy J.A. Martin (H) |
| Deputy of St. Martin | Deputy G.P. Southern (H) |
| Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S) | Deputy of Grouville |
| Deputy J.H. Young (B) | Deputy K.C. Lewis (S) |
| Deputy K.F. Morel (L) | Deputy M. Tadier (B) |
| Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L) | Deputy J.M. Maçon (S) |
| Deputy of St. John | Deputy S.J. Pinel (C) |
| Deputy M.R. Le Hégarat (H) | Deputy of St. Ouen |
| Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S) | Deputy R. Labey (H) |
| Deputy I. Gardiner (H) | Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H) |
| | Deputy of St. Mary |
| | Deputy G.J. Truscott (B) |
| | Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C) |
| | Deputy of St. Peter |
| | Deputy of Trinity |
| | Deputy S.M. Ahier (H) |
| | Deputy J.H. Perchard (S) |
| | Deputy R.J. Ward (H) |
| | Deputy C.S. Alves (H) |

THE STATES, resuming consideration of the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier, as amended, rejected the third part of the amendment of Deputy Louise Mary Catherine of St. Saviour that the existing paragraph should be designated as paragraph (a) and the following paragraph should be inserted –

“(b) to request the Minister for Social Security to extend eligibility for the Isolation Benefit to parents or carers whose children are affected by school closures and who are unable to make alternative care arrangements.”.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 22

Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy M.R. Le Hégarat (H)
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

CONTRE: 22

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

ABSTAIN: 0

THE STATES noted that, as there was an equality of votes, the matter had been determined in the negative in accordance with Article 16(2) of the States of Jersey Law 2005.

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier, as amended, and rejected the proposition –

- (a) to request the Minister for Education to take the steps necessary to close Jersey's state-run schools from Monday 14th December 2020 for the remainder of the current school term, with provision provided for vulnerable children and the children of key-workers as the Minister considered appropriate and practical.
- (b) that any such provision under paragraph (a) took into account the enhanced monitoring systems that were in place for vulnerable children;
- (c) to request the Minister for Education to ensure that all schools allowed parents to keep their children at home based on their concerns for the risk of virus transmission and not classify such children as being absent without authorisation (as long as the child had access and support provided to continue their studies); and
- (d) to request the Minister for Education and the Minister for Children and Housing to ensure that the necessary resources were made available to children and young people to ensure their access to mental health assistance is not reduced.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 15

Senator K.L. Moore
 Senator S.W. Pallett
 Senator S.Y. Mézec
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)
 Deputy of St. John
 Deputy J.H. Perchard (S)
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

CONTRE: 32

Senator I.J. Gorst
 Senator L.J. Farnham
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)
 Deputy R. Labey (H)
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)
 Deputy of St. Mary
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy of Trinity

ABSTAIN: 0

Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)
Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)
Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 106(1)(c), Deputy Inna Gardiner of St. Helier declared an interest which was not financial and remained in the Chamber for the duration of the debate on the proposition of Deputy Robert James Ward of St. Helier Helier entitled 'School Closures' (P.163/2020).

THE STATES rose at 7.07 p.m.

L.-M. HART

Deputy Greffier of the States